#### Message

From: Branning, Amy [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP

(FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=A3F510CCED11492D88CC26ED073B7F10-ABRANNIN]

Sent: 7/3/2017 4:58:05 PM

**To**: Zenick, Elliott [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group

(FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=1b2eaa2a560d415fb7c8ce9bb56c7ce5-EZENICK]; Schmidt, Lorie

[/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group

(FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=f471d4b316f74b0591322b5c63f1d01c-Schmidt, Lorie]; Srinivasan, Gautam

[/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group

(FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=d69332838210416ba51779b19025f832-GSRINIVA]; McConkey, Diane

[/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group

(FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=dfdc4d94e0114fe999130abfb281e207-McConkey, Diane]; Cozzie, David

[/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group

(FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=ee8c3582a39d4d81ac38f29a2b3abb2d-DCOZZIE]

Subject: FW: 17-1145 Clean Air Council, et al v. E. Pruitt, et al "Opinion Filed (Special Panel)" (EPA-82FR25730)

Attachments: Clean Air Council Decision.pdf

I have not read it but the court grants the motion to vacate the stay.

Amy Huang Branning EPA Office of General Counsel phone: (202) 564-1744

fax: (202) 564-5603 or (202) 564-0070

This message may contain sensitive, privileged information covered by the deliberative process, attorney-client and/or attorney work product privileges. If you believe you have received this e-mail in error, please notify me and delete the e-mail immediately.

From: Carlisle, Benjamin (ENRD) [mailto:Benjamin.Carlisle@usdoj.gov]

Sent: Monday, July 03, 2017 12:54 PM

To: Branning, Amy <Branning.Amy@epa.gov>

Cc: Schmidt, Lorie <Schmidt.Lorie@epa.gov>; Lipshultz, Jon (ENRD) <Jon.Lipshultz@usdoj.gov>; Srinivasan, Gautam

<Srinivasan.Gautam@epa.gov>

Subject: FW: 17-1145 Clean Air Council, et al v. E. Pruitt, et al "Opinion Filed (Special Panel)" (EPA-82FR25730)

Amy,

The DC Circuit issued its decision—I haven't had a chance to do anything more than very quickly skim it, but it looks like they have decided to vacate the stay. We can discuss further after we have a chance to review.

Ben Carlisle
Trial Attorney
United States Department of Justice
Environment and Natural Resources Division
Environmental Defense Section
601 D. St. NW, Room 8406
Washington DC, 20004
Benjamin.carlisle@usdoj.gov
202-514-9771

From: ecfnoticing@cadc.uscourts.gov [mailto:ecfnoticing@cadc.uscourts.gov]

Sent: Monday, July 03, 2017 12:42 PM

To: Carlisle, Benjamin (ENRD) < BCarlisle@ENRD.USDOJ.GOV>

Subject: 17-1145 Clean Air Council, et al v. E. Pruitt, et al "Opinion Filed (Special Panel)" (EPA-82FR25730)

\*\*\*NOTE TO PUBLIC ACCESS USERS\*\*\* Judicial Conference of the United States policy permits attorneys of record and parties in a case (including pro se litigants) to receive one free electronic copy of all documents filed electronically, if receipt is required by law or directed by the filer. PACER access fees apply to all other users. To avoid later charges, download a copy of each document during this first viewing.

### United States Court of Appeals for District of Columbia Circuit

# Notice of Docket Activity

The following transaction was entered on 07/03/2017 at 12:40:31 PM EDT and filed on 07/03/2017

Case Name: Clean Air Council, et al v. E. Pruitt, et al

**Case Number:** <u>17-1145</u>

**Document(s):** <u>Document(s)</u>

#### Docket Text:

OPINION [1682465] filed PER CURIAM OPINION (Pages: 23), DISSENTING OPINION (Pages: 8) by Judge Brown. [17-1145]

### Notice will be electronically mailed to:

Mr. Tim David Ballo: <a href="mailto:tballo@earthjustice.org">tballo@earthjustice.org</a>, <a href="mailto:lfuhrmann@earthjustice.org">lfuhrmann@earthjustice.org</a>, <a href="mailto:alin@earthjustice.org">alin@earthjustice.org</a>, <a href="mailto:alin@earthjusti

Felicia Hope Barnes: <a href="mailto:fbarnes@hunton.com">fbarnes@hunton.com</a>, <a href="mailto:caapleadings@hunton.com">caapleadings@hunton.com</a>, <a href="mailto:jacksonp@hunton.com">jacksonp@hunton.com</a>, <a href="mailto:hunton.com">hunton.com</a>, <a href="mailto:jacksonp@hunton.com">jacksonp@hunton.com</a>, <a href="mailto:jacksonp.gov">jacksonp@hunton.com</a>, <a href="mailto:jacksonp.gov">jacksonp@hunton.com</a>, <a href="mailto:jacksonp.gov">jacksonp.gov</a>, <a href="mailto:jacksonp.gov">jacksonp.gov</a

Samuel B. Boxerman: sboxerman@sidley.com

Mr. Andrew Lynn Brasher, Deputy Solicitor: abrasher@ago.state.al.us, lkillough@ago.state.al.us

Delanie Marie Breuer: breuerdm@doj.state.wi.us, deusterse@doj.state.wi.us

Ms. Shannon S. Broome, Attorney: <a href="mailto:sbroome@hunton.com">sbroome@hunton.com</a>, <a href="mailto:TCremer@hunton.com">TCremer@hunton.com</a>, <a href="mailto:TCRemer@hunton.co

Mr. Tomas Elias Carbonell, Attorney: tcarbonell@edf.org

Benjamin Carlisle, Trial Attorney: benjamin.carlisle@usdoj.gov

Mr. Jeffrey Allyn Chanay: jeff.chanay@ag.ks.gov, donna.wells@ag.ks.gov

Mr. Bryan Charles Clark, Assistant Solicitor General: bryan.clark@ag.ks.gov, donna.wells@ks.ag.gov

Ms. Morgan Anna Costello, Assistant Attorney General: morgan.costello@ag.ny.gov

Sean H. Donahue: sean@donahuegoldberg.com

Mr. David D. Doniger: ddoniger@nrdc.org

Mr. James D. Elliott, Counsel: jelliott@spilmanlaw.com, lisom@spilmanlaw.com, sstoner@spilmanlaw.com

Mr. P. Clayton Eubanks: clayton.eubanks@oag.ok.gov, fc.docket@oag.state.ok.us,

clayton eubanks@oag.ok.gov, cara.gorden@oag.ok.gov

Mr. Samuel Robert Flynn, Assistant Attorney General: samuel flynn@ky.gov, jan.velez@ky.gov

Mr. David S. Frankel: david frankel@ag.nv.gov

Mr. Paul Andrew Garrahan: paul garrahan@doj.state.or.us

Meleah Anne Geertsma: mgeertsma@nrdc.org, hsun-kim@nrdc.org

 $Jonathan\ Scott\ Goldman,\ Attorney: \underline{jgoldman@attorneygeneral.gov},\ \underline{ARC\text{-}Court@attorneygeneral.gov},$ 

Isheidy@attorneygeneral.gov

Mr. William G. Grantham, Assistant General Counsel: wgrantham@nmag.gov

Alice Henderson: ahenderson@edf.org

Ms. Melissa Ann Hoffer, Assistant Attorney General: Melissa Hoffer@state.ma.us

John G. Horne, II: john horne@ky.gov

John Robert Jacus, Attorney: john.jacus@dgslaw.com, kathleen.daily@dgslaw.com

Ms. Roberta Rose James: roberta james@maryland.gov

Thomas Michael Johnson, Jr., Deputy Solicitor: tjohnson@wvago.gov

Steven Beuregard Jones, Assistant Attorney General: jonesst@ag.state.la.us

Gerald T. Karr: gkarr@atg.state.il.us

Charles Howland Knauss: cknauss@hunton.com, sbroome@pacbell.net, rpavlak@hunton.com

Mr. Scott Norman Koschwitz, Assistant Attorney General: scott.koschwitz@ct.gov

Mr. Adam M. Kron, Senior Attorney: <a href="mailto:akron@environmentalintegrity.org">akron@environmentalintegrity.org</a>

Jacob John Larson: jacob larson@iowa.gov, jacob larson@iowa.gov

Mr. Matthew Ivan Levine, Assistant Attorney General: matthew.levine@ct.gov, scott.koschwitz@ct.gov

Mr. Elbert Lin, Solicitor General: elbert.lin@wvago.gov, leigh.a.brawley@wvago.gov

Mr. Aaron D. Lindstrom: <u>LindstromA@michigan.gov</u>, <u>GustafsonH@michigan.gov</u>, <u>RestucciaE@michigan.gov</u>, <u>BlackC9@michigan.gov</u>

Joel Minor: jminor@earthjustice.org, egreer@earthjustice.org

Mr. Patrick J. Morrisey: patrick.morrisey@wvago.gov

Mr. Peter Charles Mulcahy, Assistant Attorney General: peter mulcahy@state.ma.us

Eric Murphy, Solicitor: eric.murphy@ohioattorneygeneral.gov, kim.blankenship@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

Michael J. Myers, Assistant Attorney General: michael.myers@ag.ny.gov

Ms. Vickie Lynn Patton: vpatton@edf.org

Mr. Nicholas Frank Persampieri; nick persampieri@vermont.gov

Ms. Erica Peterson, Assistant Attorney General: erica.n.peterson@wvago.gov

Mr. Craig James Pritzlaff, Assistant Attorney General: craig pritzlaff@oag.texas.gov,

david laurent@oag.texas.gov, Sandra Woods@oag.texas.gov, Virginia Weldon@oag.texas.gov

Mrs. Jacquelyn Alirezay Quarles: Jackie Quarles@ky.gov

Mr. Andres Jose Restrepo, Litigation Counsel: andres restrepo@sierraclub.org

Matthew Arnold Sagsveen, Assistant Attorney General: masagsve@nd.gov

Dale Schowengerdt: dales@mt.gov, asolem@mt.gov, edoj@mt.gov, beholnbeck@mt.gov

Mr. Darin T. Schroeder: dschroeder@catf.us

Mr. Gregory Stage Schultz: gschultz@riag.ri.gov, kragosta@riag.ri.gov

Paul Martin Seby, Attorney: sebyp@gtlaw.com, lawsu@gtlaw.com, DENLitDock@GTLAW.com

Katharine Goold Shirey, Assistant Attorney General: kaysl@atg.wa.gov, ECYOLYEF@ATG.WA.GOV,

RebeccaF1@atg.wa.gov

Edward N. Siskel: edward.siskel@cityofchicago.org

Mr. James Emory Smith, Jr., Assistant Attorney General: esmith@scag.gov

Ms. Sandra Snyder: ssnyder@ingaa.org, nbyers@ingaa.org

Benna Ruth Solomon, Deputy Corporation Counsel: benna.solomon@cityofchicago.org,

david.franco@cityofchicago.org

Joanne Marie Spalding: joanne.spalding@sierraclub.org, harry.libarle@sierraclub.org

Mr. Misha Tseytlin, Attorney: tseytlinm@doj.state.wi.us, millerac@doj.state.wi.us, deusterse@doj.state.wi.us, muirheadrw@doj.state.wi.us

Barbara D. Underwood, Solicitor General: barbara.underwood@ag.ny.gov, nyoag.nycpdf@ag.ny.gov

Mr. Joel Franklin Visser: jvisser@sidley.com

Susannah Weaver: susannah@donahuegoldberg.com

Ms. Ann Brewster Weeks, Senior Counsel: aweeks@catf.us

William L. Wehrum, Jr.: <a href="www.hunton.com">www.hunton.com</a>, <a href="caapleadings@hunton.com">caapleadings@hunton.com</a>, <a href="sfisher@hunton.com">sfisher@hunton.com</a>, <a href="mailto:jacksonp@hunton.com">jacksonp@hunton.com</a>, <a href="mailto:jacksonp@hunton.com">sfisher@hunton.com</a>, <a href="mailto:jacksonp@hunton.com">jacksonp@hunton.com</a>, <a href="mailto:jacksonp.com">jacksonp.com</a>, <a href="mailto:jacksonp.com">jacksonp.com</a>,

Mr. Steven Wu: steven wu@ag.ny.gov

Mr. Peter Michel Zalzal, Attorney: pzalzal@edf.org

## Document to be served by alternative means on:

Matthew Denn Office of the Attorney General, State of Delaware 820 North French Street 6th Floor, Carvel State Office Building Wilmington, DE 19801-0000

Timothy C. Fox Office of the Attorney General, State of Montana 215 North Sanders Justice Building Helena, MT 59620-1401

Mr. Karl A. Racine
Office of the Attorney General, District of Columbia
Office of the Solicitor General
441 4th Street, NW
One Judiciary Square, Sixth Floor
Washington, DC 20001-2714

The following document(s) are associated with this transaction:

**Document Description:** Opinion Sent

Original Filename: /opt/ACECF/live/forms/17-1145.pdf

**Electronic Document Stamp:** 

[STAMP acecfStamp\_ID=1109186823 [Date=07/03/2017] [FileNumber=1682465-0] [7c0a2aa7cae722e00b255086ec56ed84198a01af00a52faf18889ad4b8d9dcab6c15d6cb0ba21000353c687453e2 28c5a4115ce58f5f250c754f89601587ac89]]

## Recipients:

- Mr. Tim David Ballo
- Felicia Hope Barnes
- · Andrew G. Beshear, Attorney
- Samuel B. Boxerman
- Mr. Andrew Lynn Brasher, Deputy Solicitor
- Delanie Marie Breuer
- Ms. Shannon S. Broome, Attorney
- Mr. Tomas Elias Carbonell, Attorney
- Benjamin Carlisle, Trial Attorney
- Mr. Jeffrey Allyn Chanay
- Mr. Bryan Charles Clark, Assistant Solicitor General
- Ms. Morgan Anna Costello, Assistant Attorney General
- Matthew Denn
- · Sean H. Donahue
- Mr. David D. Doniger
- Mr. James D. Elliott, Counsel

- Mr. P. Clayton Eubanks
- Mr. Samuel Robert Flynn, Assistant Attorney General
- Timothy C. Fox
- · Mr. David S. Frankel
- Mr. Paul Andrew Garrahan
- Meleah Anne Geertsma
- Jonathan Scott Goldman, Attorney
- Mr. William G. Grantham, Assistant General Counsel
- · Alice Henderson
- Ms. Melissa Ann Hoffer, Assistant Attorney General
- John G. Horne, II
- John Robert Jacus, Attorney
- Ms. Roberta Rose James
- Thomas Michael Johnson, Jr., Deputy Solicitor
- Steven Beuregard Jones, Assistant Attorney General
- Gerald T. Karr
- Charles Howland Knauss
- Mr. Scott Norman Koschwitz, Assistant Attorney General
- Mr. Adam M. Kron, Senior Attorney
- Jacob John Larson
- Mr. Matthew Ivan Levine, Assistant Attorney General
- Mr. Elbert Lin, Solicitor General
- Mr. Aaron D. Lindstrom
- Joel Minor
- Mr. Patrick J. Morrisey
- Mr. Peter Charles Mulcahy, Assistant Attorney General
- Eric Murphy, Solicitor
- · Michael J. Myers, Assistant Attorney General
- Ms. Vickie Lynn Patton
- Mr. Nicholas Frank Persampieri
- Ms. Erica Peterson, Assistant Attorney General
- Mr. Craig James Pritzlaff, Assistant Attorney General
- · Mrs. Jacquelyn Alirezay Quarles
- · Mr. Karl A. Racine
- · Mr. Andres Jose Restrepo, Litigation Counsel
- Matthew Arnold Sagsveen, Assistant Attorney General
- Dale Schowengerdt
- Mr. Darin T. Schroeder
- Mr. Gregory Stage Schultz
- Paul Martin Seby, Attorney
- Katharine Goold Shirey, Assistant Attorney General
- Edward N. Siskel
- Mr. James Emory Smith, Jr., Assistant Attorney General
- Ms. Sandra Snyder
- Benna Ruth Solomon, Deputy Corporation Counsel
- Joanne Marie Spalding
- Mr. Misha Tseytlin, Attorney
- Barbara D. Underwood, Solicitor General
- Mr. Joel Franklin Visser
- Susannah Weaver
- Ms. Ann Brewster Weeks, Senior Counsel
- William L. Wehrum, Jr.

- Mr. Steven Wu Mr. Peter Michel Zalzal, Attorney